



REPORT TO:	OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
DATE:	10 DECEMBER 2009
REPORT OF THE:	CORPORATE DIRECTOR (s151) PAUL CRESSWELL
TITLE OF REPORT:	REPAIRS TO FORMER TOWN HALL, MALTON
WARDS AFFECTED:	ALL

1.0 PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 As requested by Overview & Scrutiny Committee on 15 October 2009 to provide an update on the position regarding the repairs to the roof and stonework at the former Town Hall, Malton. The report to include what caused the delay, when will the work take place and the financial impacts.

2.0 RECOMMENDATION

- 2.1 It is recommended that Members receive this report and note the contents.

3.0 BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION

- 3.1 Members of the Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered this issue at a Special meeting of Overview & Scrutiny on 21 April 2009. This report updates Members following that meeting.

4.0 REPORT DETAILS

- 4.1 The former Town Hall is owned by the Fitzwilliam Malton Estate and the Council negotiated a maximum three-year extension to the lease in 2009. The tenant is required to keep the property in good and tenantable repair.
- 4.2 Problems were identified with the roof fabric in the mid to late 1990's in that tiles were becoming dislodged on a regular basis. Quotations were obtained at the time for either carrying out localised repairs or a full re-roofing. It was decided at the time to only carry out the repair work.
- 4.3 It became evident in late 2007 that tile slips were occurring with increasing regularity. Accordingly, a full condition survey was commissioned by a specialist. This survey was carried out in July 2008 by Building Care and Conservation, where the following points were noted:

- West pitched roof – “generally the slates are unstable as the nails have

become loose within the original fixing holes/nail sick: it is likely that in stormy wind conditions slates could become dislodged completely and slide off the roof onto the public right of way below". In addition, a significant dip/sag was noted in part of the roof. In view of the problem identified with the loose slates, the report suggested that some form of barrier be erected at ground level in order to protect the public.

- Stone chimney stack – repairs identified.
- East pitched roof – this was found to be in a slightly better condition than the west roof, but the loose slates fixing problem was still identified. However, any slates sliding off the roof would be caught on the adjoining flat roof and therefore would not present a hazard to the general public (unlike the west roof).
- Brick chimney stacks – both stacks were identified as being very unstable.
- Bell tower - the report states, "disappointingly this structure and lead work require urgent attention".
- Flat roof – the need for an intrusive survey to examine the substrate was identified and a lack of maintenance of the outlets.
- The report also identified issues with the stonework, however it was already known that work would need to be carried out to the external fabric before the end of the lease.

4.4 Following the receipt of the report certain actions took place. Firstly, a hoarding was established to the west elevation in order to protect the public. Secondly, the brick chimney stacks were lowered down to a safe height. Thirdly, the results of the survey were reported to the Resources Working Party on 26 August 2008. After consideration at the Policy and Resources Committee on the 2 October, on the 6 November 2008 it was agreed at Full Council to carry out the re-roofing and stonework works.

4.5 **Roof**

Works were advertised in the local press during late November /early December and tenders were returned by 23 January 2009. Two tenders were received.

- Alan Shaw Roofing in the sum of £78,131.33
- Geoff Neal Roofing Ltd in the sum of £100,547.00

These were reported to the Policy and Resources Committee meeting on 2 April 2009, where it was resolved (minute 396) that the Chief Executive be given delegated authority in consultation with the Chairman of the Policy and Resources Committee to accept:-

- (i) The tender of Alan Shaw Roofing of York in the sum of £79,531.33 for the re-roofing works to the former Town Hall, Malton and
- (ii) A suitable quotation for repairs to the exterior stonework.

4.6 **Stonework**

A conservation architect was engaged during late 2008 to schedule and prepare a suitable specification in order to enable quotations to be obtained for the stonework repairs. These works were estimated to be approximately £30,000 by the conservation architect. Prices were received just prior to the Policy and Resources meeting and varied from £84,600 to £128,433.80, these tenders had not been fully evaluated before the meeting. In view of the prices obtained the conservation

architect has been requested to re-assess the extent of work planned. The revised specification and plans have now been received.

4.7 **What had caused the delay?**

Following the Policy and Resources meeting on the 2 April 2009, the Chief Executive met with the Property Manager to review the files and papers for the contract for the roof repairs. At this time it came to light that there were some omissions in the completion of the tender documentation by the lowest tenderer which raised questions around whether the tender was valid and could be accepted. As a result of this further work was undertaken internally to establish whether this contract could be awarded.

Simultaneously the significant cost from the stonework had been evaluated. It was now clear that there was insufficient financial provision within the budget to award the two elements of the scheme. It had also been originally intended that some shared or concurrent use of scaffolding would be undertaken to reduce costs however the lowest tenderer for the roofing works had difficulties with this issue and therefore additional costs would need to be considered as the stonework contract was not ready to be let.

4.8 **When would the work be taking place?**

The intention is to re-tender the re-roofing works in early 2010, with a view to starting works on site in spring, which is the optimum time to undertake works of this nature. With regard to the stonework, clearly the first set of quotations are substantially outside the estimate suggested by the conservation architect. The architect has reviewed the scope of works originally proposed and these revised works will be tendered after the roofing tenders are known. On that basis and subject to the available budget, it is anticipated that the stonework repairs would follow on from the re-roofing works, probably during autumn 2010. It is still the intention to attempt to minimise costs by considering the shared use of scaffolding for the two pieces of work.

4.9 **What are the financial impacts?**

The original budget for the works was £145,000 and expenditure to date has generally been on fees and services. The on-going costs are for the hoarding, which is approximately £122 per month. Current capital expenditure to date is:

- Fees – roof - £2,401.72
- Fees - Stonework - £2,432.00
- RDC fees - £1,837.00
- Advertising - £600.00

Total - £7,270.72

The original tender for the roof repairs had a ninety-day currency, which lapsed on the 26 May 2008. The anticipated construction period was ten weeks. An amount of expenditure has been incurred to date and neither the roof nor the stonework has been completed. There is also the issue of the on-going costs of the hoarding. It is possible that the cost of re roofing may have increased, however it is hoped that more competition can be brought in to the process, as only 2 out of 6 firms invited to quote actually submitted a tender previously, which in itself is unusual.

4.10 Should additional funding be required this will be considered by Members in good time ahead of the scheduled works.

5.0 IMPLICATIONS

5.1 The following implications have been identified:

- a) Financial
There is a figure of £145,000 included within the Council's Capital programme for this project. To date under £7,500 has been spent.
- b) Legal
Landlords permission will be required for the work. So far the Estate have agreed, in principle, to the re-roofing work.
It is intended that these works will be subject to a JCT Standard Form of Contract.
- c) Other (Equalities, Staffing, Planning, Health & Safety, Environmental, Crime & Disorder).
No significant issues arise other than those highlighted in the report.

Paul Cresswell
Corporate Director (s151)

Author: David Summers, Property Manager
Telephone No: 01653 600666 Ext:461
E-Mail Address: david.summers@ryedale.gov.uk

Background Papers:
Policy & Resources Committee – 2 April 2009

Background Papers are available for inspection at:
Ryedale House, Malton